DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 336 052 HE 024 897

AUTHOR Nicastro, Mary L.
TITLE Ethical Dilemmas in Academia.
PUB DATE Oct 90
NOTE 7p.; Paper presented at the Small Business Institute Directors' Association, Regional Meeting, Chicago, IL, October 1990.
PUB TYPE Speeches/Conference Papers (150) -- Guides - Non-Classroom Use (055)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Conflict of Interest; *Ethics; Faculty College Relationship; Higher Education; *Moral Values; *School Business Relationship; Teacher Student Relationship
IDENTIFIERS *Small Business Institute Directors Association

ABSTRACT

This paper presents an introduction to higher education models of ethical orientation and a series of exercises that were part of a workshop on ethics given by the Small Business Institute Directors' Association (SBIDA). Three models of ethical orientation include a self-interest orientation, with the professor solely concerned with his self-interest; a trustee-like orientation with the professor as a representative of the university; or the student-focused orientation in which the professor is concerned with the students' quality of education. There follow five hypothetical ethical dilemmas: A busy assistant professor tempted to not complete a SBIDA required initial meeting with a client; a doctoral student who is not given credit for his contribution to a professor's published article; a professor tempted to list a community project completed by students under his direction as his own community service; an instructor pressured to make a volunteer activity mandatory; and a research professor with limited resources tempted to use class time to complete research with the students as subjects. A suggested format for scenario use is included with each dilemma description, with space to write out individual and group decisions. There are eight references included. (JB)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED336052

ETHICAL DILEMMAS IN ACADEMIA

by Mary L. Nicastro
Capital University
Columbus, OH

(Paper presented at the SBIDA (Small Business Institute Director's Association) Regional Meeting, Chicago, IL in October, 1990)

HE 024 897

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Mary L. Nicastro

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

"ETHICAL DILEMMAS IN ACADEMIA"

By Mary L. Nicastro
Instructor
Business Administration and Economics
Capital University
Columbus, Ohio

Currently, there is widespread interest in ethics in virtually every field including business, medicine, government, and professional sports. As educators, we are not exempt from facing ethical dilemmas in the various professorial roles including teaching, research, committee work, and student advising.

The focus of this workshop is two-fold:
(1.) to present a continuum of professional responsibility for academicians
(2.) to provide a forum for group discussion regarding ethical issues we face as SBIDA Directors, professors, and graduate students.

According to Hay and Gray (Hay and Gray, 1974), organizations typically assume one of three ethical orientations - profit maximization, trusteeship, and quality of life management. In the profit maximization orientation, the sole concern of the organization is to maximize profit. In the trusteeship orientation, the sole concern is the good of the organization. In the quality of life management orientation, there is a concern for employees, customers and society. The following continuum of social responsibility for organizations is adapted from Hay and Gray's ethical orientations:

profit maxi-mization	trustee	quality of life

Similarly, ethics in academia can be viewed as a continuum of professional responsiblity.

self-interest	trustee	student-focused

In the self-interest orientation, the professor is soley concerned with his or her self-interest in pursuing promotion and tenure. In the trustee of the university orientation, the professor views him or herself as a representative of the university. He or she is concerned with maintaining institutional norms and following policies and procedures. In the student-focused orientation, the professor is primarily concerned with the quality of education and quality of life of students.

The purpose of this workshop is to "set the stage" for group discussion. An experiential exercise on ethical dilemmas in academia will be provided. In this exercise, each participant will place him or herself in

the role of the person that must solve the ethical dilemmas represented in each scenario. Then, participants will work in small groups in order to make a group decision for each scenario. Each group will share their decisions and describe the factors that led to each decision with all workshop participants.

ETHICAL DILEMMAS IN ACADEMIA

Instructions: Presented below are five scenarios which could be encountered by SBIDA directors, professors, and graduate students. First, individually read each scenario and make a decision. Then, work in small groups (three to four participants) to make a group decision. Place your decision on the continuum of professional responsibility.

"SO MUCH WORK ... SO LITTLE TIME: THE CASE OF THE FRENZIED SBIDA DIRECTOR"

Ann, an assistant professor at a mid-sized university is an SBIDA Director. SBIDA cases are used in a seminar course entitled "Small Business Management" which is offered every semester. She is aware of the SBIDA guidelines that state that the director is responsible for conducting the initial meeting with the client at the client's place of business before referring student consulting teams to the client. She is concerned that there is little time available to meet this requirement as a result of her other professional responsiblities.

Ann teaches three other courses per semester, is involved in two committees, and is responsible for advising twenty-five students. She also has a five-month old son at home that demands a great deal of her energy. Should she attempt to fit this requirement into her overcrowded schedule or "let it slide" assuming that there is an 80% chance that students will not have a problem dealing with the client?

YOUR DECISION: _____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

GROUP DECISION: _____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

"RESEARCH 999: THE CASE OF STUDENTS AS ET.AL."

Dave, a Ph.D. student at a large university, enrolled in a course that is a requirement for his degree. During this course, a major assignment was a "joint" effort to write an article that will be submitted for publication by the professor. Although the students participated in the literature review, research, writing and editing of the article, no credit was given for their contributions. Should Dave keep quiet and consider this course to be one of the pitfalls of being a graduate student or should he confront the professor?

YOUR DECISION: _____

_____

_____

_____

GROUP DECISION: _____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

"COMMUNITY SERVICE"

Mark is an associate professor at a mid-sized university. He teaches Marketing Research, a required course for students majoring in Marketing. As a major requirement of this course, students participated in all phases of a market research project from survey development to presentation of the final report for a local, non-profit organization. Since this project was completed under his direction, Mark is considering listing this project as community service on his annual self-evaluation form. Should he include this project as community service or should he disregard it since it was primarily completed by students?

YOUR DECISION: _____

_____

_____

_____

GROUP DECISION: _____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

"FORCED VOLUNTEERISM"

Linda, an instructor at a small, private college, is a new faculty member. After a few weeks on the job, she was contacted by a faculty member who is the advisor of the school newspaper. The advisor has asked her to consider making it mandatory for students in the introductory marketing course to sell advertisements for the school newspaper. The advisor has had difficulty obtaining enough volunteers to sell ads. Should Linda be "collegial" and comply with the request or should she "think twice" about essentially making a volunteer activity mandatory?

YOUR DECISION: _____

_____

_____

_____

_____

GROUP DECISION: _____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

"HELP WANTED: SUBJECTS FOR RESEARCH EXPERIMENTS"

Bill is an associate professor at a large university with a "publish or perish" system. Bill requires a large number of subjects for the experiments he conducts. In some studies, subjects are required for two phases of an experiment (i.e., immediate versus delayed recall of information).

In the last few years, it has become increasingly difficult to obtain student volunteers as subjects. As tuition increases, more students work in part-time positions. There is little time available for volunteer activity. Also, Bill's research budget has been reduced. Therefore, he cannot afford to offer a monetary incentive to prospective subjects.

As he was writing his syllabus for Marketing 301, he considered the option of using classroom time to conduct the experiment.

Should Bill conduct his experiment in class in order to obtain subjects or should he find other alternatives to obtain subjects so that classroom time is used <u>only</u> for instructional purposes?

YOUR DECISION: _____

_____

_____

GROUP DECISION: _____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

As discussed earlier, the focus of this workshop is to provide a forum for discussion of ethical dilemmas in academia. This experiential exercise will be of value to those participants who are interested in increasing their level of awareness of ethical dilemmas in academia.

Andrews, Kenneth R., "Ethics in Practice", Harvard Business Review, September-October, 1989

Brady, F. Neil, Ethical Managing: Rules and Results, Macmillan Publishing Co., 1990

Davidson, Jeffrey P., "The Elusive Nature of Integrity: People Know it When They See It, But Can't Explain It", Marketing News, November 7, 1986

Hay, Robert and Gray, Ed, "Social Responsibilities of Business Managers", Academy of Management Journal, 18, No.1, March, 1974

Hunt, Shelby D., Wood, Van R. and Chonko, Laurence B., "Corporate Ethical Values and Organizational Commitment in Marketing", Journal of Marketing, Vol. 53, July, 1989, 79-90

Manning, George and Curtis, Kent, Ethics at Work: Fire in a Dark World, Southwestern Publishing Co., 1988

Mulligan, Hugh A., "Ethics is Topic A in Every Field", The Columbus Dispatch, April 16, 1989

Silk, Leonard, "Does Morality Have a Place in the Boardroom?", Business Month, October, 1989